

BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF.8-2112/2022-DC-PMC

Complaint through PM Portal against Dr. Sabar Ali Butt (20836-P)

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai

Chairman

Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh

Member

Mr. Jawad Amin Khan

Member

Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor

Secretary

Present:

Dr. Sabar Ali Butt (20836-P)

Respondent

Hearing dated

21.11.2022

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. A Complaint was received from Prime Minister Citizen's Portal at the Pakistan Medical Commission (the "Commission") on 09.03.2022 against Dr. Sabar Ali Butt (the "Respondent") working at Sabri Surgical Hospital Ameen Pur Bangla, Faisalabad (the "Hospital"). The Complaint reveals that the Respondent is misrepresenting himself and has mentioned multiple degrees with his name which are not authentic/registered.

II. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE TO RESPONDENT, DR. SABAR ALI BUTT

2. In view of information, a Show Cause Notice dated 03.08.2022 was issued to the Respondent, in the following terms:



4. WHEREAS, in terms of information, it is observed that, you are practicing at Sabri Surgical Hospital Ameen Pur Bangla, Faisalabad; and

5. WHEREAS, you are registered with Pakistan Medical Commission under Registration No. 20836-P, whereby you have got the degree of Basic Medical Qualification (MBBS) only. Whereas, in terms of information, you are carrying out practice of specialty and qualification(s) imprinted on your prescription pad are as follows:

Dr. Sabar Ali Butt
MBBS (Pb), RMP (Pk), M.U.S.F (Pk),
M.A.I.U.M (USA), Fellowship Ultrasound (USA),
F.T.I.D.U (Tokyo), M.S.M.Phill (Ultrasound),
Ph.D Scholar (Diagnostic Ultrasound),
Consultant Sonologist,
Member American Institute of Ultrasound Medicine,
Member Ultrasound Society of Pakistan,
Certified in Advanced Color Doppler Ultrasound Imaging from Toronomon Institute of Diagnostic Ultrasound,
Specialist at Intensive Ultrasonography.

- 6. WHEREAS, in terms of documents available on record, and information available on other social media networking accounts, you are delivering online lectures and offering "Online Ultrasound Course" of 3 months at Sabir Ultrasound Training Institute, Ghulam Muhammad Abad Faisalabad, and
- 7. WHEREAS, a general practitioner cannot practice in the field or specialty without requisite qualification duly recognized by the Commission and represent as having acquired or seek to practice a specialty unless same is recognized by the Commission. Furthermore, no registered licensee shall use or publish in any manner whatsoever any title, description or symbol indicating that or intended to lead persons to infer that he possesses any additional or other professional qualification unless, the same is registered on his license by the Commission. Therefore, in view of the facts mentioned above your conduct of representing yourself as a specialist/consultant and publishing unauthorized qualifications is in violation of Section 29 (2), (8), (10) \$\infty\$ 13 of the Act, read with Regulation 8 (2) of Code of Ethics of Practice for medical and dental practitioners, Regulations, 2011..."



III. REPLY OF RESPONDENT, DR. SABAR ALI BUTT

- The Respondent, Dr. Sabar Ali Butt submitted his reply to the Show Cause Notice on 05.09.2022, wherein he contended that:
 - a. The issued Show Cause Notice is based upon incomplete and wrong information. The Complaint does not contain any actionable claims, relevant evidences or their sources. Further, how has the Complainant seen the prescription pad of the Respondent. Thus, the Complaint is based upon vague, wrong and unsatisfactory information which is not trust worthy and is liable to be discarded.
 - b. Complainant is correct to the extent of registration of the Respondent as a doctor with the Commission, however, no documentary evidence related to the allegations is attached to the Show Cause Notice or has been submitted by the Complainant. A detailed reply is furnished as under:
 - MBBS(Pb) correct.
 - RMP (Pk) correct.
 - M.U.S.F (Pk) Yes, Dr. Sabar Ali Butt has life time membership of Ultrasound society of Pakistan
 - M.A.LUM (USA) Member of American Institute of Ultrasound Medicine.
 - Fellowship Ultrasound (USA) The respondent has the membership.
 - F.T.IDU (Tokyo) Fellowship of Toronomon Institute of Diagnostic Ultrasound. (last four are mere memberships of either any institution or ultrasound society)
 - M.S M. Phill. This degree has been awarded to the respondent by the University of Lahore which is dully attested by HEC Pakistan.
 - Ph. D Scholar (Diagnostic Ultrasound) It is correct that Dr. Sabar Ali Butt is a scholar of Ph. D of University of Lahore and a certificate has also been obtained from the University of Lahore to verify this fact and the same is also attached herewith.
 - Consultant Sonologist The respondent emphasized that this information is wrong and is not supported with any documentary evidence rather certain fake, fictitious, fabricated and self-made documents have been provided, whereas the prescription pad of Dr. Sabar Ali Butt and file rapper as a proof is being attached herewith to nullify this wrong allegation.
 - c. The respondent addressed that the Complainant has provided wrong/ incorrect information. Sabri Ultrasound is a private institute being run under the command and control of certain person who are working for the welfare of society and the respondent is working there just as a director Medical affair.



Certain fresh MBBS graduates who are well-aware of the skills and good repute of the respondent, have requested Dr. Sabar Ali Butt to teach them how to use ultrasound machine. So, keeping in view the shortage of time distance, law and order situation, covid 19, and other allied factors, the respondent accepted the request to train them to use ultrasound machine for their clinics to serve the public, better. So, the respondent is preparing and providing good skill and training to young doctors and successfully providing them confidence to run ultrasound machine at their clinic. It is liable to mention her that neither any certificate nor any diploma of ultrasound after the end of session is being offered or issued by Dr. Sabar Ali Butt to anybody else.

d. The respondent emphasized that he has not committed any violation of any concerned rules and regulation nor he has transgressed the prescribed and legitimate limits of his profession throughout his career and has not committed any misconduct then obviously no penal clause / provision attracts against him.

Hence, the Complaint is based upon hearsay and vague information. Respondent is a law-abiding citizen and cannot think to transgress the legitimate limits of his professional practice.

IV. HEARING

- 4. The matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 21.11.2022. Notices dated 14.11.2022 were issued to the Respondent, Dr. Sabar Ali Butt directing him to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 21.11.2022.
- 5. On the date of hearing, the Respondent was present before the Disciplinary Committee, in person.
- 6. The Respondent submitted before the Disciplinary Committee that he possesses a basic medical qualification i.e. MBBS, adding that he had successfully obtained post graduate qualification in Ultrasound from the University of Lahore. He denied using any illegal credentials for publicity.

V. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION



7. The Pakistan Medical Commission Act 2020 (the "PMC Act 2020") bars the medical or dental practitioners from practicing a specialty, without requisite recognition, as enshrined in section of 29 of the PMC Act 2020. The relevant provisions of the PMC Act 2020, are reproduced as under:

"29 (2) A general practitioner may treat all ordinarily recognized common medical or dental ailments and shall not practice in fields or specialties, as recognized by the Commission for which formal training is required ... No practitioner shall represent himself as a specialist or practice as a specialist without having appropriate qualifications, recognized and duly registered by the Commission.

..

29 (8) No medical or dental practitioner shall be permitted to represent in Pakistan as having acquired or seek to practice a specialty unless the same is duly registered on his license by the Authority.

. .

29 (13) 'No registered licensee shall use or publish in any manner whatsoever any title, description or symbol indicating or intended to lead persons to infer that he possesses any additional or other professional qualification unless the same has been duly recognized and registered on his licence by the Commission."

- 8. It is on record that the Respondent has mentioned multiple degrees and qualifications with his name. As per PMC licensing record the only qualification registered in the name of Dr. Sabir Ali is MBBS. The other degrees/qualifications mentioned with the name of Respondent amounts to misrepresentation in terms of section 29 of the PMC Act, 2020.
- 9. In view of the complaint, statement of the doctor and the evidences available, the Disciplinary Committee finds the Respondent, Dr. Sabar Ali Butt (20836-P) guilty of misrepresentation and imposes upon him a fine of Rs. 500,000/- (Rupees Five Hundred Thousand). The Respondent is directed to pay the amount of fine in the designated bank account of the Commission within 14 days from the issuance of this decision and forward a copy of the paid instrument to the office of the Secretary to the Disciplinary Committee. Furthermore, Dr. Sabar Ali Butt (20836-P) be issued warning letter to refrain himself from misrepresentation as specialist doctor in future.



10. The instant complaint is disposed of in the above terms.

Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh

Member

Mr. Jawad Amin Khan

Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor

Member

Secretary

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai

Chairman

<u> 21/11</u> December, 2022